Self Esteem: A Gender Based Comparison and the Causal Factors Reducing It among Indian Youth

1, Dr. Suparna Jain and 2, Ms. Prerna Dixit
University of Delhi

ABSTRACT: Self esteem is an important aspect of an individual’s identity. It impacts a person deeply so much so to impact his/her achievements and growth in various realms of life. Certain incidents in life have long lasting impact, especially the ones that have negatively impacted us. Few of such incidents are the ones which have reduced a person’s self esteem at one point or other. The present study aimed to assess such common causal incidents in the lives of Indian youth. Also a gender difference in self esteem among the sample was assessed. To fulfil the aims, a mixed methodology was employed. For quantitative data collection, a test namely, Coopersmith Self esteem Inventory was administered in order to assess the levels of self esteem among the participants. Also qualitative method of data collection, Critical incident technique was employed with 40% of the sample. In it the participants were asked to narrate the most crucial incident of their life which negatively impacted their self esteem. The data obtained was content analysed. The total number of participants was 150 college going Indian students, out of which 77 were females and 73 were males. The age range for the participants was 18-23. With the help of t test for independent means, the findings revealed that there was no significant gender difference in the self esteem levels of the participants. Even the effect size was found to be as low as 0.1. It was a finding negating many previous researches that have often found men having higher self esteem as compared to women. Through content analysis, the causal incidents reducing self esteem levels were divided into four themes, based on, unmet expectation; from personal self, from social self, at home and at school/college. The research revealed that among many causes the most common cause for reduction in self esteem have been inability to meet academic expectations of self, parents and teachers. As a result it could be seen that expectations and pressure posed by the society to be the best in academics is a matter of concern for the Indian youth today.

KEYWORDS: academic stress, gender differences, Indian college students, Self esteem

I. INTRODUCTION

Self Esteem is a crucial topic to study and research as it stretches across the full spectrum of human existence. At one end of the human behavioural continuum, for instance, low self esteem is often mentioned in regard to various mental disorders, such as depression, anxiety and learning problems. In the middle of the spectrum, self esteem is associated with more ordinary problems of living, such as, difficulties dealing with failure, losses, and other setbacks. Finally, the self esteem is also found on the other end of the continuum because it is often talked about in relation to such things as being mentally healthy, successful, living effectively and even the ‘good life’ (Mruk, 2006). Also it is difficult to dismiss the fact that low self-esteem has been identified as either a diagnostic criterion for, or associated feature of, some 24 mental disorders in the fourth edition of the Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders (American Psychiatric Association, 2000), according to O’Brien, Bartolletti & Leitzel (2006).

Low self-esteem in adolescence and young adulthood is a risk factor for negative outcomes in important life domains. For example, Trzesniewski et al. (2006) found that low self-esteem during adolescence predicts poorer mental and physical health, worse economic well-being, and higher levels of criminal activity in young adulthood. Similarly, other studies found that low self-esteem prospectively predicts antisocial behaviour, eating disturbances, depression, and suicidal ideation (Donnellan, Trzesniewski, Robins, Moffitt, & Caspi, 2005; McGee & Williams, 2000; Orth, Robins, & Roberts, 2008).
Adolescence and young adulthood seems a very vulnerable age of impacting a person’s self esteem. The person is in the formative years of his/her self concept and is experiencing manifold successes and failures in various realms of life. Social comparison is also quite high in these age groups.

A Meta analysis of definitions of self esteem based on the work of various researchers has led to a holistic definition of self-esteem: “It is the lived status of one’s competence at dealing with the challenges of living in a worthy way over time.” (Mruk, 2006)

1.1 Gender Differences In Levels Of Self Esteem

Women have often been expected and labelled as being more emotional than men. This area of gender differences is important to research, as self-esteem or self image that encompass gender may also encompass the self-conscious emotions or tendencies associated with gender (Bhardwaj & Agrawal, 2013). Women, for example, are expected to show more guilt, shame and embarrassment whereas men are accused to show more pride, but research shows that women in fact do show more guilt, shame and embarrassment than men but that men and women show the same amount of pride (Else-Quest et al., 2012).

Previous research on gender differences in self-esteem suggests that male adolescents have higher self-esteem than female adolescents do (Chubb et al., 1997; Eccles et al., 1989; Labouvie et al., 1990; McMullin & Cairney, 2004; Moksnes, Moljord, Espnes, & Byrne, 2010; Robins et al., 2002; Roerig & Eccles, 1998; Twenge & Campbell, 2001; Young & Mroczek, 2003); however, in some studies the gender difference was small (Kling, Hyde, Showers, & Buswell, 1999; Quatman, Sampson, Robinson, & Watson, 2001) or nonsignificant (Keltikangas-Jarvinen, 1990).

Likewise, several studies reported higher self-esteem for men in young adulthood (McMullin & Cairney, 2004; Robins et al., 2002; Twenge & Campbell, 2001), although in some studies the gender difference was small (Orth et al., 2010; Robins, Hendin, & Trzesniewski, 2001) or nonsignificant (Donnellan et al., 2007; Galambos et al., 2006).

1.2 Factors Impacting Self Esteem During Initial Growth Years

Academic achievement is important for children as well as adolescents. Academic achievement becomes the first identity with which a child relates himself. A student’s achieving success or consistently failing, strongly affects their individual self-esteem (Crocker et al., 2002).

Social experiences are another important contributor for it. As children go through school they begin to understand and note various differences between themselves and their classmates. By using social comparisons, children learn to judge whether they are better or worse than classmates in different activities (Bhardwaj & Agrawal, 2013). These comparisons play an important role in moulding the child's self-esteem and influence the development of positive or negative feelings they have about themselves (Butler, 1998; Pomerantz et al., 1995). As children go through adolescence peer influence becomes much more important, as adolescents make assessment of themselves based on their relationships with close friends (Thorne & Michaelieu, 1996). A successful peer relationship is very important for the development of high self-esteem for children. Social acceptance brings about self confidence and produces high self-esteem in them, whereas rejection from peers and loneliness brings about self-doubts, poor self image and produces low self-esteem (Leary & Baumeister, 2000).

Parenting can also play an important role in self-esteem development of children (Bhardwaj & Agrawal, 2013). Students in elementary school who have high self-esteem have parents who are caring and supportive, who put high standards for their child and encourage them to voice their opinion in decision making (Lamborn et al., 1991). Although studies are very limited in this regard but the common finding is that warm, supportive parenting has a high correlation with high self-esteem in children. It could easily be thought of as being a causal effect in self-esteem development (Coopersmith, 1967; Isberg et al., 1989).

The present study aimed to assess the gender differences in the levels of self esteem of Indian young adults. Also an analysis has been made of the life incidents contributing to reduction in self esteem during childhood, adolescence and young adulthood. The most vulnerable age group among the three, with most life events negatively impacting the self esteem was also found.

II. METHOD

The present research work is an exploratory study using both quantitative and qualitative research methods of data collection and analysis.

There were two basic objectives of the study:

1. To find out if there exist a gender difference among Indian college students in their levels of Self Esteem.
2. To assess the most common life events those negatively impact the self esteem of Indians since childhood to present.
To fulfil the first objective Quantitative method of data collection has been employed. A questionnaire, namely, Coopersmith Self Esteem Inventory has been administered over both male and female participants.

For the second objective, Critical incident technique has been used which is a form of qualitative method of data collection. It has been used with 40% of the sample to understand the causes of reduction of self esteem assessed from the critical life events experienced and narrated by the participants in terms of the most impactful life event that reduced their self esteem.

2.1 TOOL USED
Coopersmith Self esteem inventory (1987), The Adult form was used to assess Self Esteem of the sample. It is a revised version of the test developed by Stanley Coopersmith in 1975. The test is designed to measure evaluative attitudes towards the self in school, academic, family and personal areas of experience. In relation to the test, the term “self esteem” refers to an expression of approval or disapproval, indicating the extent to which a person believes him or herself competent, successful, significant and worthy. Self esteem is a personal judgement of worthiness expressed in the attitudes a person holds towards the self.

Since its development, the SEI has been administered to tens of thousands of children and adults participating in research studies or in special educational or clinical programs to enhance self esteem. All sociological and many cultural groups have been represented. From a review of studies conducted from 1970 through 1979, the test has been found to be highly reliable and valid (Gilbert, 1981).

2.2 SAMPLE
The sample comprised of college students chosen randomly from various educational institutes in India. The sample size was 150 participants, out of which 77 were females and 73 were males. All the respondents were within the age group of 18 to 23years.

2.3 DATA COLLECTION AND ANALYSIS
Data collection began with filling of the questionnaire which was administered with the help of acquaintances of the researchers. Confidentiality of individual responses was assured to all respondents. Once three quarters of the sample had filled the questionnaire, Critical incident technique was begun to be applied by the researchers. Incident narrators were chosen randomly from the existing pool of respondents. They were asked to narrate one most crucial personal experience of having faced any incident in their life which had drastically reduced their Self Esteem.

Comparisons between male and female students were made on their levels of Self Esteem using t test for independent means. Further, Effect size was also computed to see the exact extent of difference between the males and females in their levels of self esteem.

Critical Incidents were content analysed for the entire sample, separately for males and females to assess the common factors or issues which were the causes for the reduction of their self esteem levels. However, as most of the emerging themes were overlapping/ common, no noticeable differences were visible in the causal life events between males and females. In other words, both were having similar causes of reduction in self esteem levels and thus the themes have been pooled together for an overall understanding of causal incidents of reduction in self esteem among Indian adolescents and young adults irrespective of the gender.

III. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

Table I: The values of mean and standard deviation for males (n=73) and females (n=77) and significance of difference between them on Self esteem

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Self esteem</th>
<th>Males</th>
<th>Females</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mean</td>
<td>SD</td>
<td>Mean</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>64.44</td>
<td>17.04323</td>
<td>62.05</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results depict that the t calculated is insignificant (t=.853, p>.05). Thus, no significant difference is found between male and female college students in their levels of Self esteem. To further assess the exact difference; effect size was computed which came out to be 0.1 (See table 1) signifying a slightly higher self esteem among boys. However, the small value of effect size connotes that the discrepancy between males and females is only 0.1 standard deviations of the Self esteem levels being measured.

Previous researches have often found that men tend to have higher self esteem at this age. However, due to societal changes in the developing India the trend seems to have changed. The girls are now getting much more opportunities to step out of the house in order to get educated, explore opportunities, develop careers and even many a times make a choice of a suitable partner for marriage. There has been a reduction in stringent rules (especially in urban India) for women, which they used to have to adhere to, such as, being restricted to household chores and serve the opposite sex. The Indian society is improving slowly and steadily in helping
women make a mark and achieve equality with the men folk. The educated Indian youth of today has a good understanding of their worth and wish to succeed in their life rather than merely striving through it. Young girls with the support of their families are now being able to flourish their intellectual potentials as well as have started giving importance to economic independence before getting married. This positive change in the social milieu seems to be a reason for the present findings, where men and women both have almost equal levels of self esteem.

Further, the present study also explored the crucial life events during childhood, adolescence and young adulthood that negatively impact the self esteem among Indians. Through Critical incident technique, crucial life events were explored and content analysis was employed to analyse the data. Table II shows the qualitative data analysis.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Unmet expectation with general self</th>
<th>Unmet expectations with the Social Self</th>
<th>Unmet expectations at home</th>
<th>Unmet expectations at School/college</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Academic failure</td>
<td>28.9</td>
<td>47.4</td>
<td>61.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inability to address the audience</td>
<td>33.3</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>28.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical appearance</td>
<td>22.2</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extra-curricular</td>
<td>8.9</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fatal accident</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Getting lost in the crowd</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>21.1</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychological disorder</td>
<td>2.2</td>
<td>10.5</td>
<td>4.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It was found that the factors impacting self esteem were almost overlapping for both boys and girls as a result they were combined together. The causal factors reducing self esteem has been divided into four themes, namely, Unmet expectations in terms of Self, Unmet expectation in terms of Peer group, Unmet expectations in terms of Family and Unmet expectations in terms of school/college.

Among the four major themes, ‘unmet expectations in terms of self’ i.e. the life incidents that were against one’s own expectations from self have been found to be most negatively impacting the self esteem of Indian youth with 42.45% of them reporting it. The most common unmet expectation from self that has emerged is in context of inability to address the audience with 33.3% of participants reporting it. Other common causes within the theme were found to be Academic failure (28.9%), Dissatisfaction with Physical appearance (22.2%) and Failure at extra-curricular activities (9%). Few also reported incidents such as having a fatal accident (2.2%), Getting lost in crowd (2.2%) and having a psychological disorder (2.2%) as a reason for lowered self esteem.

The next most prevalent cause of reducing self esteem is ‘unmet expectations in terms of family’ as well as at school/college with both the themes being reported by equal percentage of participants (19.8%). These two themes cover the unmet expectations of the participants towards themselves as well as people’s unmet expectations from the participants at home and educational institution respectively.
The most common cause of reduction in self esteem in the home setting is Academic incompetence (62%) felt by the participants due to their inability to match the expectations of their parents and siblings. They have also reported that many a times parents tend to compare the participant’s academic achievements with others such as siblings, class mates and cousins. Few have also reported that parents sometimes had unrealistic expectations from them which have made them feel incompetent.

Other causal factors for reduced self esteem that have emerged at the home setting are Parental rearing practices (28.6%), Misbehaviour with parents (4.8%) and Ill health of the father (4.8%). Among parental rearing practices, the cause that has been deliberated by 14.3% of the participants is Dominating behaviour of parents. Other parental malpractices have been in non-recognition of capabilities (9.5%) and separating children from the family via hostel, day boarding etc. (4.8%).

In the school/college setting as well, the most common cause of reduction in self esteem has been Academic failure (57.1%). Other causes have been Ragging/ bullying at the hostel (14.3%), Punitive behaviour of the teacher (14.3%), Extra-curricular failure (9.5%) and Non-recognition of talent (4.8%). It is important to notice here that Academic performance is emerging as a major cause of reduction in self esteem among Indian children, adolescents and young adults. The extent of academic pressure is increasing with every coming day in schools and colleges. The competition is increasing in the minds of the students, their parents as well as the school authorities. It has become a common cause of stress among the youth of India today.

‘Unmet expectations with the social self’ is the fourth theme which is reducing the self esteem of Indian youth with 17.9% participants reporting it. Social Self in the present context includes friends/peers and love interest. Within this theme the most prominent cause of reduction in self esteem has been found to be Relationship failure with the love interest reported by 47.4% participants. Varied causes such as trust breach (21.05%), rejection to love proposal (10.5%), being dumped (5.3%), being verbally abused (5.3%) and mental exploitation by partner (5.3%) are the causes for the failure in the relationship and thus reduced self esteem.

Other sub themes pertaining to social self are emotional dependency on friend (21.05%), stereotypes faced due to ethnicity (5.8%), exploitation by partner (5.3%) and experience of ejection to love proposal (10.5%).

3.1 OVERALL CAUSAL ANALYSIS

The findings of the study reveal that though there are varied causes for reduction in self esteem among Indian youth, the most prominent cause is the inability to meet academic expectations of parents, teachers as well as self. We are in a dire need to change our perspective towards the concept of achievement in school and college years. The attainment of good marks should not be the sole criteria of assessing an individual’s ability and need to achieve. Unnecessary competition and comparison can lead to a lot of stress and often can have negative long lasting impact over a person’s self concept.

Academic stress is a mental distress with respect to some apprehended frustration associated with academic failure, apprehension of such failure or even an awareness of the possibility of such failure (Gupta and Khan, 1987). In the context of school, academic stress means a pervasive sense of urgency to learn all these things which are related to or prescribed by the school (Shah, 1988). Kahlon's (1993) study revealed that lack of parental help, congenial examination system, living up to parental expectation, attitude of the teachers and fear of examination are major stress causing factors. Berg and Keinan's (1986) also found that imposing excessively high self expectation was the most trouble stressor leading to academic stress.

In the present study as well it is quite clear that inability to meet academic expectations of self, parents as well as teachers are together negatively impacting self esteem.

According to the Health Ministry of India, Out of every three cases of suicide reported every 15 minutes in India, one is committed by a youth in the age group of 15 to 29. Every 90 minutes a teenager tries to commit suicide in India. No. of suicides due to failure in examination were 2010 in the year 2009, 2479 in the year 2010 and 2381 in 2011. Psychiatrists sought to assess why the trend has risen of late and put it down to three reasons: deprivation of sunshine, exam results, and the copycat syndrome. (Students suicide statistics, AASRA, 2013)

A study (conducted 10 years back) had found that 16 per cent of Mumbai students were depressed - that is 2 per cent more than the students in Boston. It also found that 8 percent of these were suicidal. Today, 10 years later, researchers say things could be worse. Statistics show that India has the highest suicide rate in the world, marginally behind China, but ahead of the west. 95-100 people commit suicide in India every day and of these a whopping 40% are in the adolescent age group (CNN-IBN Report, Jan 13 2010).
The leading mental health institution in India, the National Institute of Mental Health and Mental Sciences in Bengaluru, has been involved in several studies to understand why the rates of people taking their own lives, particularly younger people, are on the rise. In the last formal study conducted in 2007, the Institute found that 122,637 people ended their own lives and for every successful act, it estimated that 8-10 attempts go unreported. Nearly three-fourths of those taking their own lives were aged 16-45 years. Bengaluru topped the list of cities where the largest number had taken place, followed by Chennai. In New Delhi data collected from 1,205 adolescents (aged 12-19 years) in two schools revealed that, on average, one in seven adolescents had thought about ending their life. A lack of methods to help identify youngsters at risk further hinders prevention efforts (Guardian Weekly, Jan 28 2010).

IV. CONCLUSION

Findings reveal that there is no gender difference among Indian college students in their levels of self esteem. This reveals a bright side of developing India as girls becoming more independent in their personal and career choices have risen in their levels of self esteem. This could be said so because earlier researches often depicted males having higher levels of self esteem than females.

However, the results also reveal academic pressure as a major cause of reducing self esteem among Indian students. Thus, it is required that a holistic approach is developed which puts the emphasis on an atmosphere of care in the schools and at home to allow children to address their fears and cope with stress. Children should not be pressurized by making comparisons with peers on the basis of academic performance. Every child has his/her own potentials and aptitudes which should be respected by the parents and the teachers. Academia should not be viewed as the sole source of achievement. Rather children should be given space to enjoy other activities and sports. This requires a major shift in the viewpoints of both parents and teachers in terms of importance they give to excellence in studies which has become an important ingredient of Indian culture today.

V. ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

This research work was taken up as a part of practical exposure to be provided to the students studying Psychology at the undergraduate level at Delhi University. We thank all the students of Psychology Honours (Batch 2012-2015), Daulat Ram College, Delhi University for helping us in data collection and compilation.

REFERENCES


www.ijhssi.org 14 | P a g e
Self Esteem: A Gender Based Comparison and the Causal Factors...


